**INTERNATIONAL ELECTROTECHNICAL COMMISSION SYSTEM FOR CERTIFICATION TO STANDARDS RELATING TO EQUIPMENT FOR USE IN EXPLOSIVE ATMOSPHERES (IECEx SYSTEM)**

**TITLE: Compilation of comments and Observations on -** **ExTAG/720A/CD** **Draft ExTAG Decision Sheet – Tightening torque values of torque test for Ex blanking elements and Ex thread adapters**

**Circulated to: ExTAG – IECEx Testing and Assessment Group**

**INTRODUCTION**

This document contains the compilation of comments, as well as observations, from the originator, CCCMT, CN, on ExTAG/720A/CD Draft ExTAG Decision Sheet – Tightening torque values of torque test for Ex blanking elements and Ex thread adapters.

As a result of comments received, and considered, the originator prepared a further revised Draft Decision Sheet ExTAG/720B/CD Draft ExTAG Decision Sheet – Tightening torque values of torque test for Ex blanking elements and Ex thread adapters for discussion during the 2024 ExTAG Meeting

***Please inform the Secretariat immediately of any omissions or errors at-***

***Christine***

**ExTAG Secretariat**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Address:****Level 17, Angel Place****123 Pitt Street****Sydney NSW 2000****Australia** | **Contact Details:****Tel: +61 2 46 28 4690****Fax: +61 2 46 27 5285****e-mail: info@iecex.com**[**http://www.iecex.com**](http://www.iecex.com) |

| **ExCB/****ExTL** | **Clause/ Sub-clause** | **Paragraph Figure/****Table** | **Type of****comment****General/****technical/****editorial** | **COMMENTS** | **Proposed change** | **Observation****(to be completed by the originator)** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CNE/CQST** **CN** | **-** | **-** | **T** | **NO** | **NO** | **Noted** |
| **CNEX-Global BV****NL** |  |  | **T** | **The use of interpolation between values, should not be allowed, because in general in the IEC 60079-xx standards, testing/construction parameters are specified for sizes ‘up-to’, not for in between sizes.****Example:****IEC 60079-7:2015 Table 2: Required separation distances for Ex e circuits: For 225V the required Ex eb distance must be taken from the line with the next higher voltage (250V). Interpolation for 225V is not permitted.**  | **Withdraw DS** | **Comment noted for referral to the ExTAG Brazil Meeting** |
| **DEKRA / BVS****DE** |  |  | **General** | We are in favour with the DS. |  | **Noted** |
| **DNV****NO** |  |  | **Gen** | **We agree with the Draft DS.**  |  | **Noted** |
| **Eurofins CML** | **C.3.3.1****C.3.4.1**  | **Table C.1** | **General** | **Answer no.****Use torque values as stated in table C.1 or next stated higher thread value test torque (if thread is not shown in the table).** |  | **Comment noted for referral to the ExTAG Brazil Meeting** |
| **ExTCAU** |  |  |  | **ExTAG720A/CD Decision Sheet appropriate and acceptable, with no changes needed** |  | **Noted** |
| **FIDI****HR** |  |  | **T/E** | **In general we agree that linear interpolation of Table C.1 values for intermediate sizes is permitted but we think that graph is not helpful. Also, no need for example of calculation, everybody should know what is linear extrapolation** | **We propose simple answer:****Linear interpolation of Table C.1 values for intermediate sizes is permitted.** | **Agree. Revised the “ANSWER “part.** |
| **FMG****US** |  |  | **ed** | **The existing applicability text as written has two options that are mutually exclusive:****The DS shall be applicable to:– all issues (revisions) of the certifications issued after the publication of this DS and– only for the new certifications (Issue No. 0) and their subsequent revisions.** | **Revise text to delete the words “only” and “the”****The DS shall be applicable to:– all issues (revisions) of the certifications issued after the publication of this DS and– only for the new certifications (Issue No. 0) and their subsequent revisions.** | **Agree****Delete“– only for the new certifications (Issue No. 0) and their subsequent revisions”** |
| **FMG****US** |  |  | **ed** | **We note that proposed approach is consistent with Table 15 of IEC 60079-0, Ed 7 for torque tests on bushings.****Torque values for sizes other than those specified above may be determined from a graph plotted using these values. In addition, the graph may be extrapolated to allow torque values to be determined for stems of bushings larger than those specified.** | **Consider using essentially the same text for the answer, no need to complicate it any further.****Torque values for sizes other than those specified may be determined from a graph plotted using these values.** | **Agree** |
| **FTZU****CZ** |  |  | **G** | **We agree with this draft ExTAG Decision Sheet.** |  | **Noted** |
| **KR Hellas** |  |  |  | **KR Hellas has no comment** |  | **Noted** |
| **LCIE****FR** |  |  | General | We agree with the Draft Decision Sheet. |  | **Noted** |
|  **NANIO CCVE (RU)** |  |  | **General** | **We support DS ExTAG/720A/CD without any comments.** |  | **Noted** |
| **NEPSI****CN** |  |  | **G** | **We support the revised draft decision sheet ExTAG/720A/CD.** |  | **Noted** |
| **QPS****ExCB** |  |  |  | **QPS agrees to DS and has no comments** |  | **Noted** |
| **Simtars****AU** |  |  |  | No comments from Simtars. |  | **Noted** |
| **TC 31****MT 60079-1** | **Answer** |  | **Technical** | The response is overly complicated. The answer should be changed to simply state that linear interpolation between two table values is permitted. | **Replace the entire answer with the following: “The torque value may be calculated using linear interpolation between two values in Table C.1.”** | **Agree. Revised** **the “ANSWER “part.** |
| **TIIS****JP** |  |  | **ge** | We agree with the draft DS with the following comment.In "The DS shall be applicable to:" field, certificates in the second bullet are already covered by the first bullet. | **Remove the item in the second bullet.** | **Agree** |
| **ULBR****BR** | **Answer** |  | **Technical** | **The response is overly complicated and just plots the linear interpolation between points (rather than a curve based on a formula covering all table values). The answer should be changed to simply state that linear interpolation between two table values is permitted.** | **Replace the entire answer with the following: “The torque value may be either that specified for the next higher size in Table C.1 or the value calculated using linear interpolation between two values in Table C.1.”** | **Agree. Revised** **the “ANSWER “part.** |
| **ULBR****BR** | **Existing certified products** |  | **Editorial** | **Wording is confusing and should be deleted since it doesn’t add any clarity.** | **~~“How the proposed draft decision sheet affects existing certified products :~~**~~The proposed draft decision just provides a suggested torque value,which is determined from a graph plotted using the values in Table C.1.For the existing certified products with Ex thread adapters and Ex blanking elements,the torque test is basically based on this torque value or the higher thread size value,which is more stringent.”~~ | **Agree. Revised the** **“ANSWER “part.** |
| **UL Solutions (US)** | **Answer** |  | **Technical** | **The response is overly complicated and just plots the linear interpolation between points (rather than a curve based on a formula covering all table values). The answer should be changed to simply state that linear interpolation between two table values is permitted.** | **Replace the entire answer with the following: “The torque value may be either that specified for the next higher size in Table C.1 or the value calculated using linear interpolation between two values in Table C.1.”** | **Agree. Revised the** **“ANSWER “part.** |
| **UL Solutions (US)** | **Existing certified products** |  | **Editorial** | **Wording is confusing and should be deleted since it doesn’t add any clarity.** | **~~“How the proposed draft decision sheet affects existing certified products :~~**~~The proposed draft decision just provides a suggested torque value,which is determined from a graph plotted using the values in Table C.1.For the existing certified products with Ex thread adapters and Ex blanking elements,the torque test is basically based on this torque value or the higher thread size value,which is more stringent.”~~ | **Agree. Revised the****“ANSWER “part.** |